Table of Contents

CAPSULE SUMMARY 1
PERSPECTIVE 43

■ PART ONE: FEDERAL COURTS AND POLITICAL BRANCHES OF THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT

I. PROBLEMS OF JUDICIAL REVIEW 47
- **I. Introduction** 49
- **II. The Institution of Judicial Review** 49
  - A. Political Insulation of the Federal Judiciary 49
  - B. Marbury v. Madison 49
- **III. Federal Courts Cannot Issue Advisory Opinions** 50
  - A. The Case or Controversy Requirement 50
  - B. Applications 51
- **IV. Standing** 51
  - A. Sources and Purposes of the Standing Requirement 51
  - B. Three Constitutional Requirements for Standing 52
  - C. Additional "Prudential" Limitations on Standing 58
  - D. Special Problems of Taxpayer Standing 62
  - E. Standing in the Supreme Court to Review State Court Decisions . 64
- **V. Ripeness** 65
  - A. Sources and Purposes of the Ripeness Requirement 65
  - B. Requirements and Application 65
- **VI. Mootness** 67
  - A. Sources, Purposes, and Operation of the Mootness Doctrine 67
  - B. Exceptions to the Operation of Mootness 68
- **VII. Political Question Doctrine** 71
  - A. Sources and Purposes of the Political Question Doctrine 71
  - B. Modern Explication of the Political Question Doctrine 73
  - C. Categories of Cases to Which the Political Question Doctrine Has Been Applied and the Case Dismissed 74
  - D. Areas in Which Application of the Political Question Doctrine Has Been Rejected 76

II. CONGRESSIONAL POWER TO REGULATE FEDERAL JURISDICTION . . 77
I. Introduction 79
II. Distinction Between Congressional Power Over the Jurisdiction of the Supreme Court and of the Lower Federal Courts 79
A. Article III Provisions About Establishment of the Supreme Court and Lower Federal Courts 79
B. The Distinction Between Original and Appellate Jurisdiction of the Supreme Court 80
C. Relevance of Other Constitutional Provisions 80
III. Congressional Power to Regulate Lower Federal Court Jurisdiction 81
A. The Traditional Theory of Broad Congressional Power 81
B. Alternative Constructions of Article III 82
C. Recent Congressional Regulation of Lower Federal Court Jurisdiction 84
IV. Congressional Power to Regulate Supreme Court Original Jurisdiction 85
A. Article III Self–Executing Regarding Some Cases 85
B. Congressional Role Regarding Supreme Court Original Jurisdiction 86
V. Congressional Power to Regulate Supreme Court Appellate Jurisdiction 87
A. The Exceptions Clause 87
B. *Ex Parte McCardle* and the Theory of Broad Congressional Power . 87
C. The "Essential Functions" Theory 88
D. The Limitation–As–To–Fact Theory 89
VI. Limitations on Congressional Power Deriving From Other Constitutional Provisions 89
A. Equal Protection 89
B. Due Process 90
C. Separation of Powers 90
VII. Congressional Power to Vest Article III Courts With Non–Article III Powers 94
A. Characteristics of an Article III Court 94
B. The Concept of "Non–Article III Powers" 94
C. Article III Courts Performing Non–Judicial Functions 94
D. Article III Courts Entertaining Cases Not Falling Within the Judicial Power of the United States 97

III. LEGISLATIVE COURTS 99
I. Introduction 100
II. Article III Courts and Legislative Courts 100
A. Article III Provides Protection for Article III Judges and Defines Judicial Power 100

B. Article I Permits Congress to Create Legislative Courts 101
III. Constitutional Limits on Congressional Power to Vest Article I Courts With Authority to Decide Article III Matters 101
A. Importance of the Issue 101
B. Early Uncertainty About Whether Article I Courts May Adjudicate Article III Matters 102
C. Modern Evolution: The "Inherently Judicial" Doctrine and Adjudication of Constitutional Facts 105
IV. Adjudication by "Adjuncts" to Article III Courts 109
A. Background: The "Adjunct" Theory 109
B. Administrative Agencies 109
C. Bankruptcy Courts 111
D. Magistrate Judges 112

■ PART TWO: THE STRUCTURE OF FEDERAL COURT JURISDICTION

IV. FEDERAL QUESTION JURISDICTION **119**
I. Introduction 120
II. Constitutional and Policy Bases for Federal Question Jurisdiction . 120
A. The Constitutional Grant of Judicial Power 120
B. "Protective Jurisdiction" 121
C. Policy Underpinnings for Federal Question Jurisdiction 123
III. The Statutory Grant of Federal Question Jurisdiction 123
A. Section 1331—The General Federal Question Statute 123
B. Scope of the Statutory Grant: The Well–Pleaded Complaint Rule . 125
C. Scope of the Statutory Grant 129

V. DIVERSITY OF CITIZENSHIP AND ALIENAGE JURISDICTION **133**
I. Introduction 135
II. Constitutional, Statutory, and Policy Bases for Diversity of Citizenship and Alienage Jurisdiction 135
A. The Constitutional Grants of Judicial Power 135
B. The Statutory Grants of Diversity of Citizenship and Alienage Jurisdiction 136
C. Policy Underpinnings for Diversity of Citizenship and Alienage Jurisdiction 138
III. Determining Whether the Case Involves Appropriate Litigants . . . 140
A. The Complete Diversity Rule 140
B. Determining Citizenship of Human Beings 143
C. Determining Citizenship of Corporations 146
D. Determining Citizenship of Non–Incorporated Associations 148

E. Determining Citizenship in Cases by or Against Representatives . 149
IV. Determining Whether the Amount in Controversy Requirement is Satisfied . . . 150
A. The Amount in Controversy Requirement and its Rationale 150
B. Assessing the Amount in Controversy 151
C. Aggregation of Claims 153
D. Claims for Equitable Relief 155
V. Exceptions to Diversity of Citizenship and Alienage Jurisdiction . 156
A. Judge–Made Exceptions for Domestic Relations and Probate Cases . 156
B. Statutory Prohibition of Collusive Joinder to Create Jurisdiction . . 157

VI. SUPPLEMENTAL JURISDICTION **159**
I. Introduction 160
II. Policy Issues 160
III. Historical Development of Supplemental Jurisdiction 162
A. Definitional Issues: "Pendent", "Ancillary," and "Supplemental" . 162
B. Until 1990, the Doctrine Was Developed by Case Law, Not Legislation 162
C. The *Finley* Decision Led to Passage of the Supplemental Jurisdiction Statute in 1990 165
IV. The Supplemental Jurisdiction Statute 168
A. Overview of the Statute 168
B. The Grant of Supplemental Jurisdiction in § 1367(a) 168
C. Restrictions on Supplemental Jurisdiction in § 1367(b) 170
D. Discretionary Decline of Supplemental Jurisdiction Under § 1367(c) 172
E. Tolling Provision of § 1367(d) 173
F. Some Problems in Applying § 1367 174

VII. REMOVAL JURISDICTION **177**
I. Introduction 178
II. General Principles of Removal Jurisdiction 178
A. Removal Contrasted With Remand 178
B. Removal is Available Only to Defendants 178
C. General Venue Provisions Do Not Apply in Removal Cases 179
D. Generally, a Case is Removable Only if the Federal Court Would Have Subject Matter Jurisdiction Over it 179
E. Case is Removable Even if State Court Lacked Subject Matter Jurisdiction 180
III. Grants of Removal Jurisdiction 180
A. Removal is Governed by Statute 180
B. The "General" Provision for Removal of Diversity and Federal Question Cases 181
C. Special Considerations Regarding Removal of Federal Question

Cases . . . 181
D. Special Considerations Regarding Removal of Diversity Cases . . . 183
E. Specialized Grants of Removal Jurisdiction . . . 185
IV. Procedures for Removal and Remand . . . 186
A. Defendant Files Notice of Removal in Federal Court . . . 186
B. Timing of Removal . . . 187
C. Remand to State Court . . . 187

VIII. SUPREME COURT JURISDICTION . . . **189**
I. Introduction . . . 191
II. Constitutional and Statutory Structure . . . 191
A. Article III Draws Distinction Between Original and Appellate Jurisdiction of the Supreme Court . . . 191
B. Relationship Between the Supreme Court's Original and Appellate Jurisdiction . . . 192
III. Original Jurisdiction of the Supreme Court . . . 194
A. Cases Between Two or More States . . . 194
B. Other Cases in Which a State is a Party . . . 195
C. Cases Involving Ambassadors, Public Ministers, etc. . . . 196
IV. Appellate Jurisdiction of the Supreme Court . . . 196
A. Statutory Provisions For The Supreme Court's Appellate Jurisdiction . . . 196
B. Review Of State Court Decisions: Background . . . 198
C. Review Of State Court Decisions: Highest State Court . . . 199
D. Review Of State Court Decisions: The Final Judgment Rule . . . 199
E. Review Of State Court Decisions: The "Independent And Adequate State Ground" Doctrine . . . 203
F. Review of State Court Decisions: Findings of Fact . . . 208
G. Review Of Decisions Of The Courts Of Appeals . . . 208

■ PART THREE: FEDERAL COURTS, FEDERALISM AND THE STATES

IX. STATE COURTS AND FEDERAL POWER . . . **215**
I. Introduction . . . 217
II. The Role of the State Courts in the Federal System . . . 217
A. Constitutional Presumptions About State Courts . . . 217
B. Statutory Scheme and the Concepts of Concurrent and Exclusive Subject Matter Jurisdiction . . . 218
III. State Court Power to Adjudicate Federal Matters . . . 219
A. The Presumption of Concurrent Jurisdiction and the Doctrine of Implied Exclusivity . . . 219

B. State Court Adjudication of Issues Falling Within Exclusive Federal Jurisdiction . . . 221
IV. State Court Obligation to Adjudicate Federal Claims . . . 222
A. The Traditional Rule . . . 222
B. The "Valid Excuse" Doctrine . . . 223
C. State Court Obligation to Employ Federal Procedures in Adjudicating Federal Claims . . . 226
V. State Court Power to Control Federal Officers . . . 227
A. Writs of Habeas Corpus . . . 227
B. Mandamus and Injunctions . . . 229
C. Relevance of Federal Officer Removal . . . 230

X. STATE SOVEREIGN IMMUNITY AND THE ELEVENTH AMENDMENT . . . 233
I. Introduction . . . 235
II. Background and History of the Eleventh Amendment . . . 235
A. The Evolving Concept of Sovereign Immunity . . . 235
B. The *Chisholm* Decision and Ratification of the Amendment . . . 236
III. Interpretation of the Eleventh Amendment . . . 237
A. Narrow Literal Terms Have Not Limited Application of the Amendment . . . 237
B. The Amendment Does Not Bar All Suits Against States . . . 237
C. The Amendment Bars Specified Suits in Federal Court Regardless of Jurisdictional Basis . . . 238
D. Nature of the Eleventh Amendment Defense . . . 239
E. What Constitutes the State? . . . 240
F. Summary of Methods for Avoiding the Bar of the Amendment . . . 242
IV. Avoiding the Bar of the Eleventh Amendment: The *Ex Parte Young* Doctrine . . . 242
A. The *Ex Parte Young* Case . . . 242
B. Development of Current Doctrine on Specific Issues . . . 243
C. Development of Current Doctrine Concerning Remedies . . . 244
V. Avoiding the Bar of the Eleventh Amendment: Waiver by the State . . . 246
A. The Traditional Waiver Rule . . . 246
B. Actions by the State Constituting Waiver . . . 246
VI. Avoiding the Bar of the Eleventh Amendment: Congressional Abrogation . . . 247
A. Background on the Concept of Congressional Abrogation . . . 247
B. Direct Abrogation by Congress . . . 247
C. Determining Whether Congress Intended Direct Abrogation Under § 5 of the Fourteenth Amendment . . . 249
D. Indirect Abrogation by Congress (or "Constructive Waiver") . . . 250

XI. ABSTENTION **253**
I. Introduction 254
II. Sources of the Abstention Doctrines 254
A. The Concept of Judge–Made Abstention 254
B. Comparative Aspects of The Different Forms of Abstention 255
III. *Pullman* Abstention 256
A. The *Pullman* Case 256
B. Rationale and Requirements of *Pullman* Abstention 257
C. Costs of *Pullman* Abstention 259
IV. *Burford* Abstention 259
A. The *Burford* Decision 259
B. Rationale and Requirements of *Burford* Abstention 260
V. *Thibodaux* Abstention 263
A. The *Thibodaux* and *Frank Mashuda* Cases 263
B. Rationale and Requirements of *Thibodaux* Abstention 264
VI. *Colorado River* Abstention 265
A. The *Colorado River* Case and Progeny 265
B. Rationale and Requirements of *Colorado River* Abstention 268
VII. Procedural Aspects of Abstention 269
A. The *England* Doctrine—Procedure in *Pullman* Abstention 269
B. Certification to State Court 270

XII. THE ANTI–INJUNCTION STATUTE **273**
I. Introduction 274
II. The Statute and Background 274
A. The Statutory Provision 274
B. History and Background 274
III. The Scope of the Statutory Exceptions 277
A. The "Expressly Authorized" Exception 277
B. The "In Aid of Jurisdiction" Exception 278
C. The "Relitigation" Exception 280
IV. Other Statutory Restrictions on Federal Injunctions Against State Activities 281
A. The Tax Injunction Act of 1937 281
B. The Johnson Act of 1934 282
V. Injunctions of Federal Judicial Proceedings 282
A. Injunction by a Federal Court 282
B. Injunction by a State Court 283

XIII. "OUR FEDERALISM": THE DOCTRINE OF *YOUNGER V. HARRIS* **285**
I. Introduction 287
II. Background 287
A. The Concept and Contours of "Our Federalism" 287
B. Relationship to the Anti–Injunction Statute 288

III. Historical Development 289
A. Early Cases 289
B. The *Dombrowski* Case 289
C. *Younger v. Harris* and the Modern Concept of "Our Federalism" . . 290
D. Exceptions to the Operation of *Younger* 291
IV. The Timing of Federal Intervention 292
A. The Distinction Between Future and Ongoing Prosecutions 292
B. Post–Trial Intervention 295
V. Applicability of *Younger* to Civil Proceedings 296
A. Background 296
B. Developments After *Younger* 296
VI. Applicability of *Younger* to Non–Judicial State Action 297
A. State Executive Actions 297
B. State Administrative Actions 298
C. State Legislative Actions 299

XIV. ACTIONS TO VINDICATE FEDERAL CIVIL RIGHTS **301**
I. Introduction 303
II. Principal Civil Rights Statutes 303
A. Section 1983 303
B. Contrast With Habeas Corpus 304
C. Other Reconstruction–Era Civil Rights Statutes 305
D. Modern Civil Rights Statutes 306
III. Litigation Under § 1983 306
A. Section 1983 Was Little–Used Until 1961 306
B. *Monroe v. Pape* Invigorated the Statute 307
C. Plaintiff Must be a Citizen or Person Within U.S. Jurisdiction 308
D. Defendant Must be a "Person" 308
E. Defendant Must Have Acted "Under Color" of "State Law" 310
F. Defendant Must Have Deprived Plaintiff of a Federal Right 312
G. Remedies, Including Attorney's Fees 316
H. Miscellaneous Litigation Issues 317
IV. Immunity From § 1983 Cases 320
A. Background and Definitions 320
B. Absolute Immunity 321
C. Qualified ("Good Faith") Immunity 323
V. Deprivations Under Color of Federal Law: *Bivens* Claims 325
A. Section 1983 Does Not Apply to Federal Actors 325
B. *Bivens* Recognizes a Right to Sue a Federal Actor for Damages for Deprivation of a Constitutional Right 325
C. Limitations on the Scope of the *Bivens* Claim 327
D. Procedural Issues in Cases Asserting a *Bivens* Claim 329
VI. Civil Rights Removal Jurisdiction 330
A. Background and the Provision for Civil Rights Removal 330

B. "Equal Rights" Interpreted Narrowly 332
C. The Distinction Between State Statutes and State Practices 333
D. The "Modern" Era 334

XV. HABEAS CORPUS 337
I. Introduction 339
II. Background, Origins of the Writ, and Overview of Current Statutory Provisions 339
A. The Concept of Habeas Corpus 339
B. History of the Writ 340
C. Overview of Current Statutory Provisions, as Amended by the Antiterrorism and Effective Death Penalty Act of 1996 (AEDPA) . . 340
III. Habeas Corpus for State Prisoners 342
A. Basic Statutory Provisions 342
B. Statutory Requirement of Exhaustion of State Remedies 342
C. Waiver by the State of the Exhaustion Requirement 344
D. Review of State Court Findings 344
E. Deprivations Cognizable in Federal Habeas Corpus Proceedings . 347
F. Statute of Limitations and Limitations on Successive Applications for Federal Habeas Relief 349
G. Appellate Review of Federal Habeas Decisions 350
H. Special Provisions for Capital Cases 350
IV. "Abortive State Proceedings"—The Problem of Independent and Adequate State Grounds 351
A. Background: Case Law Through *Wainwright v. Sykes* 351
B. Subsequent Developments 353
V. Habeas Corpus for Persons in the Custody of the United States . . 355
A. Statutory Provisions 355
B. Some Specific Issues Concerning Habeas Corpus by Persons in Federal Custody 356

XVI. FEDERAL COMMON LAW 357
I. Introduction 358
II. Sources of and Justification for Federal Common Law 358
A. Federal Common Law and the *Erie* Doctrine 358
B. Federal Common Law and the Rules of Decision Act 359
C. The Reach of Federal Common Law 360
III. Application of Federal Common Law in Specific Areas 360
A. Use of Federal Common Law to Fill Statutory "Gaps" 360
B. Federal "Proprietary" Interests 362
C. International Relations 366
D. Admiralty 367
E. Interstate Disputes 369
F. Interstate Pollution 369

G. Enforcement of Constitutional Rights 370
H. Claim and Issue Preclusion Effects of Federal Judgments 370

XVII. CLAIM AND ISSUE PRECLUSION IN THE FEDERAL SYSTEM 371
I. Introduction 372
II. Full Faith and Credit and Related Common Law Doctrines 372
A. Constitutional Provision 372
B. Statutory Provision—The Full Faith and Credit Act 373
C. Situations Covered by Neither Full Faith and Credit Provision . . . 375

APPENDICES

App.
A Answers to Review Questions 381
B Model Examination 395
C Glossary 403
D Text Correlation Chart 411
E Table of Cases 413
F Index 419